

## **Analysis of Technical Guidance Implementation: Evaluation of Voting and Vote Counting by KPPS in the 2024 Election in North Petukangan**

**Khansa Khairun Nisa Jatmiko Putri<sup>1</sup>, Ananda Putri Khaila<sup>2</sup>, Fadly Firmansyah<sup>3</sup>, Dina Thalentaria Nainggolan<sup>4</sup>, Ana Sabhana Azmy<sup>5</sup>**

Universitas Pembangunan Nasional Veteran Jakarta<sup>12345</sup>

\*E-mail: [khansakhairunnisa003@gmail.com](mailto:khansakhairunnisa003@gmail.com)

### **ABSTRACT**

*Elections are a characteristic of a democratic country, held once every 5 years in Indonesia. The holding of democratic elections can't be separated from the democratic implementation process. Since 2015, elections have been held simultaneously. The 2024 elections will include legislative and presidential votes. In the 2024 elections, several problems have arisen due to the limited number and experience of PPS members, the "technical guidance" implementation schedule, the mechanism for implementing "technical guidance" materials, ad hoc recruitment process, the professionalism and heavy workload of KPPS . Based on these issues, this research aims to analyze the ability to implement technical guidance materials during the voting and vote-counting process by KPPS in the 2024 elections, focusing on the North Petukangan Subdistrict, Pesanggrahan District, South Jakarta. This study used qualitative research methods. Data collection was carried out through interviews in the field with relevant stakeholders. The results of the research indicate that there are still significant obstacles in implementing the voting and vote-counting process by KPPS in North Petukangan Subdistrict. This is influenced by various factors, such as limited time and space in distributing "technical guidance" materials, technological obstacles related to Sirekap, as well as the limited knowledge and experience of KPPS members.*

**Keywords:** *Democracy, Election, KPPS, Technical Training*

### **INTRODUCTION**

Elections are a familiar activity for the Indonesian public, having been conducted since their inception in 1955(Lev, 2009; Lubis, 2020). Elections represent a democratic celebration in Indonesia, held every five years(Davidson,

2018; Romli, 2019). This five-yearly event involves all segments of society (Fionna & Hutchinson, 2019; Mietzner, 2014). In Indonesia, elections are managed by authorized organizing bodies (Kusdarini et al., 2022; Mietzner, 2020). Referring to Law No. 7 of 2017 concerning Elections, there are three election organizing bodies in Indonesia. These include the General Elections Commission (KPU), the Election Supervisory Body (Bawaslu), and the Election Organizer Honorary Council (DKPP) (Ghofur, 2022; Sudrajat et al., 2022).

The KPU is an independent national body, supported by provincial and district/city KPUs organized hierarchically to ensure comprehensive distribution across the Republic of Indonesia (Riwanto et al., 2024; Vani et al., 2020). Given the extensive scope of work managed by the KPU, the organization comprises various divisions and job descriptions to facilitate bureaucratic operations and achieve optimal election results (Ibrahim, 2017; Mantali & Abdussamad, 2023). Therefore, within the structure of the KPU, there are two deputies and two main inspectorates responsible for their respective duties. These deputies include the Deputy for Technical Support and the Deputy for Administration. The Deputy for Technical Support oversees five bureaus: the Bureau of Electoral Operations, the Bureau of Logistics, the Bureau of Legal Advocacy and Dispute Resolution, the Bureau of Legislation, and the Bureau of Public Participation and Relations (Ibrahim & Madjid, 2018).

The Deputy for Technical Support handles the preparation and execution of operational logistics distribution, regulation drafting, legal assistance, public relations, legal documentation, and election dispute resolution. Meanwhile, the Deputy for Administration manages human resources, administrative affairs, domestic equipment, archiving, and management within the KPU. The Deputy for Administration also coordinates with provincial and district/city KPUs. However, it is not only the officials, members, secretaries-general, and experts of the KPU who play a role in organizing elections. Through district/city KPUs, ad hoc bodies are established to assist in election implementation (Ibrahim, 2017; Niswaty et al., 2019). The role of these ad hoc bodies is crucial as they determine the success of elections. As an extension of the KPU, these ad hoc bodies operate under legal

frameworks. The KPU's ad hoc bodies include the District Election Committee (PPK), Overseas Election Committee (PPLN), Voting Committee (PPS), Polling Station Working Committee (KPPS), and Overseas Polling Station Working Committee (KPPSLN). These ad hoc bodies operate hierarchically, with the PPK at the district level, the PPS at the rural level, and the KPPS responsible for voting and vote counting at polling stations. The PPLN and KPPSLN function abroad. As one of the election organizers, the ad hoc bodies also take an oath and undergo inauguration. The KPPS, in particular, will directly interact with the public voting for the President and Vice President, DPR, DPD, Provincial DPRD, and District/City DPRD in the 2024 elections scheduled for Wednesday, February 14, 2024.

Individuals interested in becoming KPPS members can register and will receive training through technical guidance from the KPU before election day. The technical guidance materials for ad hoc bodies are managed by the Electoral Operations Division in conjunction with the Bureau of Public Participation and Relations of the KPU RI, as stipulated in PKPU No. 14 of 2020. The distribution of technical guidance materials to ad hoc bodies across Indonesia will be conducted simultaneously, including in the North Petukangan sub-district, South Jakarta. North Petukangan is located in the Pesanggrahan District of South Jakarta, comprising 11 RW (neighborhood associations) and 186 polling stations (TPS), with 1,302 KPPS officers. The total number of polling stations makes North Petukangan the area with the most TPS in Pesanggrahan District, South Jakarta. The high number of TPS in North Petukangan leads to various cases in the area. One notable case is at TPS 56 in North Petukangan, where all KPPS members became exhausted during their duties and abandoned the TPS midway through vote counting. This anomaly in election implementation required police intervention to compel the KPPS chair to complete the vote-counting process, as ballot boxes had to be returned to the PPS by 12:00 PM on Thursday, February 15, 2024. The issue arose from excessive working hours, resulting in fatigue and a lack of knowledge among KPPS members, prolonging the vote counting process beyond the target time.

Errors made by KPPS officers were due to many unforeseen challenges not covered in the technical guidance but encountered in the field. Additionally, many PPS and KPPS officers for the 2024 election lack experience from the 2019 election. The extensive workload and excessive working hours led to mistakes in voting and vote counting, as seen at TPS 56 in North Petukangan. Inexperienced KPPS members and numerous changes in the technical mechanisms of voting and vote counting for the 2024 election necessitate more in-depth technical guidance for experienced KPPS officers.

The frontline of election administration is critically scrutinized as it is seen as the determinant of the success of the 2024 election. KPPS faces many limitations, from understanding to the technical execution of voting and vote counting by KPPS chairs and members. The lack of knowledge or skills among KPPS is due to the suboptimal implementation of technical guidance by the KPU, particularly since these ad hoc officers are ordinary citizens. Therefore, providing technical guidance at the ad hoc level, specifically from PPS to KPPS, must be supervised by the KPU, as the success of voting and vote counting conducted by KPPS stems from their knowledge and capabilities. Referring to KPU Decision No. 66 of 2024 concerning Technical Guidelines for Voting and Vote Counting in General Elections, the KPU has prepared comprehensive materials exceeding 200 pages, necessitating substantial technical guidance for KPPS officers to understand them. Hence, this journal aims to examine the communication patterns and distribution of technical guidance provided by the KPU RI to its lower tiers, specifically the KPPS. This journal also evaluates the voting and vote counting process in the 2024 elections in the North Petukangan sub-district.

## **METODE PENELITIAN**

This research employs a descriptive qualitative approach, focusing on specific phenomena. The qualitative approach involves descriptive data derived from observing the behaviors of individuals in the study, encompassing both written and spoken words (Moleong, 2018). The focus of qualitative research is on social phenomena as perceived by the participants. By conducting a documentation study,

the author seeks to visualize the perspectives of the involved parties through materials consisting of written documents produced by the relevant parties (Austin & Sutton, 2014; Daher et al., 2017; Malagon-Maldonado, 2014). The purpose of research using a descriptive qualitative approach with case study analysis techniques on "Review of Implementation of Training Materials: Evaluation of the KPPS Voting and Vote Counting Process in the 2024 Election in North Petukangan" is to explore a bound system by examining various cases involving multiple sources of information over time within a specific context during data collection. By collecting detailed and in-depth data, the study can be reviewed from a program, event, activity, or from individuals and organizations (Ishtiaq, 2019). The use of case study analysis techniques aims to focus on a specific phenomenon. This research utilizes data from literature studies on the election process and data obtained through interviews with PPS and KPPS members in North Petukangan. The intent is to examine the phenomenon based on the behavior, perceptions, motivations, and actions experienced by the research subjects and to describe them through writing and language. After collecting data through literature studies and interviews, the subsequent steps in the analysis technique performed by the author include data input, data analysis, and then drawing conclusions and verification.

## **RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

### **Communication Patterns and Information Distribution of "Technical guidance" from KPU RI to KPPS**

Effective communication patterns and information distribution between the City KPU to the Voting Committee (PPS) are two important factors to ensure the running of the election properly and correctly (Amida et al., 2024; Arif, 2020; Sinulingga & Zulkarnain, 2023). In the distribution of information regarding "technical guidance", KPU RI provides information to the City KPU through a two-way communication pattern with the aim that the information that comes can be received and understood properly. Then, the technical guidance given to the City KPU by KPU RI to prepare the process of voting and vote counting in the election. In addition, KPU RI also does not forget to maximize the use of social media as a

communication tool in providing information about “technical guidance” through KPU RI's official website. After the information is received from KPU RI, the next City KPU provides technical guidance to convey information to PPS to clarify the process of voting and vote counting during the election. In PKPU Number 8 of 2022 Article 1 paragraph (8) states that PPS is an election organizing institution formed to carry out voting at the rural level. Meanwhile, according to PKPU Number 8 of 2022 Article 1 paragraph (10). The “technical guidance” material delivered includes; the process of voting and counting votes at polling stations (TPS), how to mark valid and invalid votes, the vote recapitulation process, as well as general policies in voting and counting votes provided directly or by using electronic media, namely through PDF material that is expected to be understood by all PPS members.

Based on an interview conducted on March 21, 2024, with Bagas Saputra (a member of the PPS), it can be explained that before carrying out all the stages of the election process, the PPS first received "technical guidance" (technical guidance) from the City KPU. After the PPS understands their duties according to the 2024 election timeline, the PPS will distribute the materials they received during the "technical guidance" to the KPPS. The KPPS are the officials responsible for conducting the voting and counting at polling stations (TPS) on a temporary/ad hoc basis during the local elections. The KPPS is established based on Law Number 7 of 2017 concerning Elections, particularly Article 59, which emphasizes that the PPS is the party responsible for forming the KPPS. In forming the KPPS, considerations are given to gender equality, the absence of prejudice, and the representation of all layers of society.

In the context of conducting technical guidance, the PPS has a very important strategic role for the KPPS. Voting at the polling stations (TPS) must be carried out in accordance with the applicable laws and regulations. Both the PPS and the KPPS are part of an ad hoc body that is established to assist the work of the KPU in organizing the elections (Milagsita, 2023). At the TPS level, the KPPS plays a crucial role in the voting process. They are responsible for overseeing the voting procedures, verifying voter identities, ensuring the completeness of the ballots, and transparently counting the results. Additionally, the KPPS manages voter queues,

enforces order and security, and resolves any conflicts that may arise at the TPS. On the other hand, one of the duties and responsibilities of the PPS in the voting and counting process at the TPS is to distribute the technical guidance materials to the KPPS in accordance with the applicable procedures. The aim is to prepare technical guidance for the KPPS to address any issues that may arise on voting day as well as during the vote counting process. This is because good election preparation is crucial to ensure a fair and efficient process.

Based on the information obtained from an interview with Vina Erdiana (Member of the Polling Station Committee - KPPS - of North Petukangan Sub-district) on March 21, 2024, it was revealed that the distribution of "technical guidance" materials was done in an ineffective manner. During the "technical guidance" activities, PPS members explained the material only by reading PowerPoint slides and showing simulation videos of vote collection and counting without conducting actual simulations with KPPS members directly. Many attending KPPS members felt bored during the "technical guidance," leading to a lack of attention towards the material being presented by the PPS. Additionally, not all KPPS members attended the "technical guidance" sessions.

Furthermore, according to the KPU timeline, the provision of "technical guidance" material by PPS to KPPS is only conducted once. However, KPPS members in North Petukangan feel that a single session of "technical guidance" is insufficient, thus, for example, KPPS members in RW 04 of North Petukangan Sub-district requested a second session to deepen their understanding of the technical aspects of vote collection and counting. However, in the second "technical guidance" session conducted independently by KPPS with PPS North Petukangan, only additional explanations on using the Sirekap application were provided. Although further explanation regarding Sirekap was given by PPS, many KPPS members still struggled to understand how to operate the application. KPPS members found it difficult to practice using the Sirekap application independently because the application can only be accessed on the day of vote counting. Thus, KPPS members were unable to anticipate potential issues that may arise. The distribution of "technical guidance" materials by PPS members without conducting

simulation activities left KPPS members unable to envision any scenarios that may occur during the voting process at the polling stations. Ideally, the "technical guidance" conducted by PPS should involve simulations on the day of vote collection and counting. Conducting simulations of the vote collection and counting process may help KPPS members better understand their roles and responsibilities, anticipate potential issues, and find solutions to overcome them on the actual voting day.

Knowledge about the duties of KPPS is the responsibility of PPS to produce competent, neutral, and honest KPPS members who have sufficient understanding to carry out their duties at the polling stations. However, KPPS in North Petukangan Sub-district also faces issues regarding this matter, including the large number of inexperienced members who are confused about new policies such as the use of Sirekap, as well as the lack of time and space to conduct simulations of the vote collection and counting process during the implementation of "technical guidance." As a result, KPPS members are not prepared and lack an understanding when faced with certain situations that may arise during the vote collection and counting process at the polling stations. Considering the complexity and importance of the responsibilities of KPPS in conducting vote collection and counting, conducting "technical guidance" activities only once may not be enough to ensure that every KPPS member understands their duties well and is ready to perform their roles. Additionally, conducting "technical guidance" activities on weekdays causes many KPPS members to be unable to attend due to other matters. This leads to a significant percentage of KPPS members not understanding their respective duties and roles.

During the voting and vote counting process, the PPS plays a crucial role in ensuring the efficiency of procedures at the polling stations. This includes overseeing the entire voting process and addressing any issues that arise during the voting process. In the case study of KPPS in North Petukangan Sub-district, for example, at TPS 56, there were several obstacles during the vote counting and collection process which resulted in the vote counting taking longer than it should have. One of the obstacles was the limited voting space, with only 3 polling booths



available, causing delays in the voting process from the scheduled time. This, of course, resulted in delayed vote counting. Overcoming obstacles in the voting and counting process is the responsibility of the PPS to ensure that KPPS members coordinate effectively and carefully check each ballot placed in the ballot box. Furthermore, the PPS is also responsible for ensuring that the procedure for summarizing the voting results is carried out correctly.

Based on various data obtained from interviews with PPS and KPPS members of North Petukangan Sub-district on March 21, 2024, it is evident that the PPS has a crucial strategic role in the implementation of "technical guidance" and all stages of the voting process. From all the issues that occurred during the voting and vote counting process in North Petukangan Sub-district, the PPS needs to streamline the distribution of "technical guidance" materials, ensure that KPPS members understand the information, address any obstacles that may arise during the voting process, and ensure that the summarization of voting results runs smoothly. Thus, the PPS of North Petukangan Sub-district can ensure that the election process runs smoothly, safely, and in line with the ideals of democracy by improving the quality and effectiveness in the North Petukangan Sub-district area.

### **Evaluation of the Stages of Voting and Vote Counting Implementation in the 2024 Elections in North Petukangan Sub-district.**

In the electoral process, both in the voting and vote counting stages, it is crucial for every organizer at the polling station level, namely the KPPS, to fully and comprehensively understand the technical aspects of voting and vote counting in the 2024 elections. In this regard, the Indonesian Election Commission (KPU RI), which is the electoral organizing body at the national as well as at the regional levels including provinces, cities, districts, and sub-districts, must ensure that all technical aspects related to the procedures of voting and vote counting are well understood by all KPPS members through the provision of comprehensive technical guidance or "technical guidance" involving all KPPS members (Perdana et al., 2019).

The provision of comprehensive and detailed "technical guidance" materials to KPPS is crucial in the stages of voting and vote counting in the 2024 elections.

KPPS members at each polling station have the duty and function to conduct the voting and vote counting processes in accordance with the regulations set by the Indonesian Election Commission (KPU RI) as stipulated in Regulation No. 25 of 2023 concerning the voting and vote counting in general elections. The provision of "technical guidance" by the PPS certainly has implications for the understanding and abilities of KPPS members in carrying out their duties in the voting and vote counting processes in the 2024 elections. The provision of "technical guidance" is similar to Education and Training conducted by bureaucratic organizations aimed at improving the capabilities and development of human resources while also serving as one of the ways to mitigate issues within an organization (Elizar & Tanjung, 2018).

Mangku Negara (2004) Training is the process of imparting knowledge and skills in a particular field to create skilled employees who are capable and responsible for their work to a greater extent, in accordance with standards. Therefore, in the implementation of voting and vote counting in the 2024 elections in North Petukangan Sub-district, the issues faced are somewhat similar to those encountered in the 2019 elections. This may be due to the similarity in the implementation of elections between 2019 and 2024, both being simultaneous elections. However, specifically, the problem lies in the first place, with the limited number and experience of PPS members. Yuli Aprianto, the Chairperson of the PPS in North Petukangan Sub-district, stated that "technical guidance" was provided by the PPS to 186 polling stations with a total of 1,302 KPPS members. The provision of "technical guidance" materials by the PPS to KPPS was conducted by dividing the schedule into two days with two sessions due to the limited number of PPS members, which is only three. Bagas Saputra, a member of the PPS in North Petukangan Sub-district, also confirmed this:

*"The problem is the number of KPPS members in North Petukangan Sub-district, which is 1,302 people, while the number of PPS members in the sub-district is only 3 people, so it's overwhelming. And all three PPS members are new and have minimal experience." (Interview: March 21, 2024).*

The second issue relates to the schedule of conducting "technical guidance." The schedule set by the PPS for KPPS members in North Petukangan Sub-district was on Wednesday, January 31, 2024, and Thursday, February 1, 2024, held at the auditorium of Budi Luhur University. Yuli Aprianto, the Chairperson of the PPS in North Petukangan Sub-district, stated:

*"In one day, we divided it into two sessions, starting from 08.00-11.00 and 15.00-18.00, with approximately 300 KPPS members attending each session."*

Thirdly, the issue concerns the recruitment of ad hoc organizers in the elections. The recruitment process of ad hoc bodies, particularly PPK, PPS, and KPPS, lacks comprehensive requirements related to the capabilities of potential election organizers. Ad hoc organizers are strategically important as they are the ones directly interacting with the community in their respective areas. However, there is difficulty in ensuring the competence and capabilities of ad hoc organizers regarding their duties in the election process. Therefore, many potential ad hoc organizers, including PPK, PPS, and KPPS members, lack experience and understanding of their roles and functions. According to Mathias & Jackson, recruitment is the process of gathering a group of people who meet the competency qualifications required by an institution to perform tasks or duties within that institution (Halisa, 2020). Bagas Saputra, a member of the PPS in North Petukangan Sub-district, explained:

*"Many KPPS members are inexperienced because around 60% of the KPPS members in North Petukangan Sub-district are beginners. Many of them are participating directly in an election for the first time and become KPPS members, so they are still confused about their conditions, they don't know. There are also KPPS members who already have experience but are also confused because of many new rules, such as the use of Sirekap." (Interview: March 21, 2024).*

Fourthly, the professionalism of the Polling Station Working Groups (KPPS). This is evident from the occurrence of errors in several polling stations in North Petukangan Sub-district related to the voting and vote counting processes, as well as the recapitulation process at the polling station level. There are technical

aspects that do not comply with the guidelines and regulations of the polling stations, resulting in errors in the voting, counting, and recapitulation processes.

Bagas Saputra, a member of the PPS in North Petukangan Sub-district, conveyed:

*"In several polling stations, there were many mistakes due to discrepancies in writing the plenary CI. Then, at TPS 56, there was also an incident where KPPS members left the polling station and went home to take a rest." (Interview: March 21, 2024).*

The errors are also caused by the ineffective mechanism of implementing "technical guidance," as mentioned in the third point. Fifthly, regarding the workload of KPPS. The implementation of the 2024 elections is not much different from the 2019 elections, where the elections are held simultaneously, including presidential elections, as well as elections for the national parliament (DPR RI), regional representatives council (DPD RI), provincial legislative councils (DPRD province), and district/city legislative councils (DPRD kabupaten/kota). This heavy workload makes the burden on KPPS very heavy, especially considering that KPPS members are also responsible for preparing the needs at their respective polling stations regarding location and logistics preparation. Muhammad Mufti Aliansyah, a member of the KPPS in North Petukangan Sub-district, stated:

*"Starting from February 11, us KPPS members began preparing the needs of the polling stations, such as setting up tents, preparing benches and tables. Also, because out of the 7 KPPS members, 2 are female, so only five of us, the male members, prepared the polling station needs. On the night before the polling day, some of us were assigned to collect logistics from the sub-district logistics warehouse and also prepare the arrangement of the polling station because the voting process starts at 7 in the morning. After the counting process, we KPPS members are obligated to deliver the ballot boxes to the district logistics warehouse, where our vote counting process ended at 4 in the morning." (Interview: March 21, 2024).*

With the simultaneous elections containing five ballot papers, although in the DKI Jakarta Province area it only contains four ballot papers as they do not vote for the city council, it's no wonder that many KPPS members complained of exhaustion due to the workload exceeding their capacity, resulting in some KPPS members falling ill. In addition to physically collecting the voting and counting

results directly to the PPS, there is a new mechanism where KPPS members also have to scan the voting and counting result reports using an application called "Sirekap." However, the existence of the "Sirekap" application actually creates new problems such as many KPPS members not understanding how to use the application, as well as issues within the Sirekap application itself. As a result, the vote counting recapitulation process took longer than the scheduled time.

## **CONCLUSION**

The conclusion of this research highlights several main issues faced in the voting and vote counting process by Polling Station Committees (KPPS) in North Petukangan Subdistrict, South Jakarta, in the 2024 election. Based on the case study results in North Petukangan Subdistrict, it is evident that there are still many obstacles in the voting and vote counting process by KPPS in this area. This occurs because, as stated by Bagas Saputra (Member of PPS in North Petukangan Subdistrict) on March 21, 2024, the understanding of KPPS members is still limited. PPS plays a strategically important role in ensuring the success of the entire voting process and the implementation of "technical guidance". However, due to time, location, and opportunity constraints for direct simulations, the distribution of "technical guidance" material in North Petukangan Subdistrict was not very successful, resulting in insufficient knowledge among KPPS members. From the presented research results, it is evident that PPS faces challenges in ensuring a good understanding from KPPS members, especially regarding the constraints of time and place for simulations and technological constraints on Sirekap. Therefore, further study is needed to identify more effective training methods, especially in overcoming these limitations. This research can explore the implementation of innovative learning tools or the use of technology for distance learning. Thus, these actions can enhance the understanding and readiness of KPPS members to carry out their duties more effectively.

## **REFERENCES**

Amida, T. L., Nababan, S., & Utomo, A. S. (2024). General Election Commission Public Communication Strategy in Increasing General Election Participation

in Blitar. *MUKASI: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi*, 3(1), 17–30.

- Arif, A. (2020). Measuring The Competence And The Independence Of Ad Hoc Committee And Its Effect On The Performance Of General Election. *Terbuka Journal of Economics and Business*, 1(1).
- Austin, Z., & Sutton, J. (2014). Qualitative research: Getting started. *The Canadian Journal of Hospital Pharmacy*, 67(6), 436.
- Daher, M., Olivares, H., Carré, D., Jaramillo, A., & Tomicic, A. (2017). Experience and meaning in qualitative research: A conceptual review and a methodological device proposal. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 18(3), 24.
- Davidson, J. S. (2018). *Indonesia: Twenty years of democracy*. Cambridge University Press.
- Elizar, E., & Tanjung, H. (2018). Pengaruh Pelatihan, Kompetensi, Lingkungan Kerja terhadap Kinerja Pegawai. *Maneggio: Jurnal Ilmiah Magister Manajemen*, 1(1), 46–58. <https://doi.org/10.30596/maneggio.v1i1.2239>
- Fionna, U., & Hutchinson, F. E. (2019). Indonesia's 2019 elections: A fractured democracy? *Asian Affairs*, 50(4), 502–519.
- Ghofur, A. (2022). Election Supervisory Body's in Indonesia Post-Reform 2003-2017. Available at SSRN 4160638.
- Halisa, N. N. (2020). Peran Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia “Sistem Rekrutmen, Seleksi, Kompetensi dan Pelatihan” Terhadap Keunggulan Kompetitif: Literature Review. *ADI Bisnis Digital Interdisiplin Jurnal*, 1(2 Desember), 14–22. <https://doi.org/10.34306/abdi.v1i2.168>
- Ibrahim, A. H. H. (2017). Effect of Public Participation to Improve the Election Commission (KPU) Performance in Ternate City Major Election. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 7(1), 1–7.
- Ibrahim, A. H. H., & Madjid, S. (2018). The role of political parties on election commission performance in 2015 mayor election of Ternate city. *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research*, 7(2), 118–123.
- Ishtiaq, M. (2019). Book Review Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage. *English Language Teaching*, 12(5), 40. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v12n5p40>
- Kusdarini, E., Priyanto, A., Hartini, S., & Suripno, S. (2022). Roles of justice courts: settlement of general election administrative disputes in Indonesia. *Heliyon*, 8(12).

- Lev, D. S. (2009). *The Transition to Guided Democracy: Indonesian Politics, 1957-1959*. Equinox Publishing.
- Lubis, A. A. A. M. R. (2020). Contestation on Political Space Between Islamism and Islamic Group in Presidential Election 2019. *Al-Tahrir: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 20(2), 205–229.
- Malagon-Maldonado, G. (2014). Qualitative research in health design. *HERD: Health Environments Research & Design Journal*, 7(4), 120–134.
- Mantali, I., & Abdussamad, J. (2023). Reform Election Management Bureaucracy To Make A Democratic Election With Integrity In Gorontalo City. *Public Policy Journal*, 3(2), 104–112.
- Mietzner, M. (2014). How Jokowi won and democracy survived. *J. Democracy*, 25, 111.
- Mietzner, M. (2020). Authoritarian innovations in Indonesia: electoral narrowing, identity politics and executive illiberalism. *Democratization*, 27(6), 1021–1036.
- Milagsita, A. (2023). *Perbedaan PPK, PPS, dan KPPS dalam Pemilu: Pengertian dan Tugasnya*. DetikJakteng.
- Moleong, L. J. (2018). *Metodelogi Penelitian Kualitatif* (Edisi Ketu). PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Negara, A. P. M. (2004). Manajemen sumber daya manusia perusahaan. In S. Sandiasih (Ed.), *Bandung, PT Remaja Rosdakarya* (Edisi kedu). PT Reamaja Rosdakarya.  
<https://www.semanticscholar.org/paper/444aa7732f914e94159cf1cf9cbaf01e6bba152f>
- Niswaty, R., Cudai Nur, A., Rijal, S., Dhahri, I., & Nasaruddin, N. (2019). Democratization and Performance of General Election Commission on Implementation of Simultaneously Province Regional Election. *International Conference on Public Organization (ICONPO)*.
- Perdana, A., Liando, B. M., Rizkiyansyah, F., Nugroho, K., Sukmajati, M., Tanthowi, P., & Anggraini, T. (2019). Tata Kelola Pemillu di Indonesia. In *Tata Kelola Pemilu di Indonesia*.
- Riwanto, A., Suryaningsih, S., & Firmandiaz, V. (2024). Preventing Electoral Fraud in Indonesia: Protecting the Social Security of Election Management Personnel. *Jurnal Media Hukum*, 31(1).
- Romli, L. (2019). Political Identity and challenges for democracy consolidation in Indonesia. *Politik Indonesia: Indonesian Political Science Review*, 4(1), 78–

98.

Sinulingga, Y. S. A., & Zulkarnain, I. (2023). Governance of Technical Guidance at the Voting Organizing Group (KPPS) level in the 2019 Election in Tebing Tinggi City: Determinants of the Continuity of Democracy. *PERSPEKTIF*, 12(4), 1184–1196.

Sudrajat, T., Rahmawati, U., Hersusetiyati, H., & Irawati, T. (2022). The Arrangement of Election Administration Organization In Law Number 7 Of 2017 Concerning Elections: Policy, Organizational And Political Analysis. *Proceedings of the Third International Conference Administration Science, ICAS 2021, September 15 2021, Bandung, Indonesia*.

Vani, R. V., Habibie, D. K., & Maryani, M. (2020). Dynamic Governanc e Pekanbaru City in Policy Implementation About The New Normal in Pandemic Covid-19 Era. *Iapa Proceedings Conference*, 173–193.