

## The Indonesian Government's Efforts to Form Democratic Citizens through Democratic Education

Reviandari Widyatiningtyas<sup>1)</sup>, Alek Andika<sup>2)</sup>, Warlim<sup>3)</sup>, Ory Syafari Jamel Sutiyan<sup>4)</sup>, Adlin<sup>5)</sup>

<sup>1)</sup> *Mathematics Education Department, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education Universitas Langlangbuana, Jalan Karapitan No. 116, Kota Bandung Jawa Barat, Indonesia 40261*

<sup>2)</sup> *English Education Department, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education, Universitas Ma'arif Nahdlatul Ulama Kebumen, Jl. Kusuma, Kebumen, Jawa Tengah 54316*

<sup>3)</sup> *General and Character Education Department, Faculty of Education, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Jl. Dr. Setiabudhi No. 229 Bandung, Jawa Barat 40154*

<sup>4)</sup> *Government Science Department, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Riau, Jl. HR Subantas KM 12.5, Pekanbaru, Riau 28293*

<sup>5)</sup> *Government Science Department, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Universitas Riau, Jl. HR Subantas KM 12.5, Pekanbaru, Riau 28293*

*Corresponding Author: Reviandari Widyatiningtyas, Email: [revywidya63@gmail.com](mailto:revywidya63@gmail.com)*

---

**History:** Received 26/12/2022 | Revised 01/01/2023 | Accepted 30/01/2023 | Published 15/02/2023

---

**Abstract.** Problems with democracy in Indonesia indicated that citizens do not have a democratic attitude. This research aims to find out the efforts of the Government of Indonesia in shaping democratic citizens through democracy education. The writing of this article used qualitative research methods with an analytical descriptive approach. To obtain data, this research used library studies with library data collection techniques and documentation. The results of this research showed that the government's efforts to form democratic citizens through democratic education are carried out by making educational policies. One of the Government's efforts that is considered effective to form democratic citizens was to integrate Civic Education with democracy education. This is in accordance with the task carried out by Civic Education to form students into democratic and responsible citizens. Through civic education there will be socialization and dissemination of democratic values in society. This is part of the ideals of democracy, one of which is to realize Civic Education as democratic education. Thus it can be concluded that through learning Civic Education, students are expected to be able to develop a democratic attitude.

---

**Keywords:** *Government of Indonesia; Citizens; Democratic Education*

---

### INTRODUCTION

Although it has been seven decades, democracy in Indonesia does not seem to be well established. Popular sovereignty, which in other terms, Democracy means 'people who are able to govern themselves' (Yung, 2010), has actually caused its own problems. The implementation of democracy so far in Indonesia has been tainted by behaviors that are contrary to the principles of democracy itself, such as money politics, black campaigns, fake news, violence and conflicts

due to different political orientations, politics based on ethnicity, race, religion, and intergroup. The problems of democracy in Indonesia indicate that citizens do not have a democratic attitude. To realize a democratic country, of course, it can only be implemented if its citizens understand and have a democratic attitude (Santika, 2022). A democratic attitude is one of the attitudes that every citizen must have (Dianti et al., 2020). True democracy requires democratic attitudes and behaviors of its people.

Democracy itself can be interpreted as a thought to be able to behave and act that equally weighs between rights and obligations of oneself (Zulfa & Haryanto, 2021). Meanwhile, being democratic is respecting all differences and decisions. In a democratic country, democratic citizens are needed. The democratic nature of citizens is reflected in their openness, sportsmanship, peacefulness, not forcing opinions, being responsible and not violating the rights of others. Without democratic citizens, the aspired democratic state will never be realized.

Democratic citizens are citizens who have the attitude to live in a democracy. Have critical thinking skills to be able to build individual character with a democratic attitude (Ngongo & Gafur, 2017). Democratic citizens are citizens who have good life behavior in personal and state life by upholding democratic values (Aspin, 2018). In reality, democracy requires a condition of life, namely citizens who have and uphold democratic values (Suryatni, 2014). With democratic values, citizens who have a democratic attitude will be formed (Tican & Taspinar, 2015).

Some of the democratic values that guide the creation of democratic citizens are solving problems peacefully and institutionally, ensuring the implementation of peaceful change in a changing society, organizing a regular change of leaders, limiting the use of violence to a minimum level, recognizing and considering the

existence of diversity and ensuring the upholding of justice (Syahindra, 2019).

It is not easy for the state to form democratic citizens with a foundation of democratic culture. It takes the efforts of all parties to be involved and participate in creating citizens with democratic attitudes (Duman, 2010). In terms of formal education, the law mandates that education should lead students to become democratic citizens (Rini, 2017). The question is what kind of education is developed in an effort to form democratic citizens? And who is responsible for the formation of democratic citizens?

Some research that were considered relevant to this issue such as the research of (Rosyad & Indramayu, 2020) entitled *Paradigma Pendidikan Demokrasi Dan Pendidikan Islam Dalam Menghadapi Tantangan Globalisasi Di Indonesia*. Research was conducted by (Khaerah et al., 2021) entitled *Pendidikan Demokrasi Berbasis Sekolah*, and (Azra, 2005) in his article entitled *Pendidikan Kewargaan untuk Demokrasi di Indonesia*.

From some of these studies were the advantages, that democracy education is implemented through civic education. It is just that it does not explain the Government's policy as a government effort in shaping citizens' democratic attitudes. The difference as well as the purpose of this research was to show the Government's efforts in shaping

democratic attitudes through democracy education.

In this context, the government has the main role and responsibility in shaping democratic citizens. Moreover, the government is constitutionally the executor or implementer of the law (Zuiderwijk & Janssen, 2014). The strategies and policies that the government can take to form democratic citizens are through democratic education (Santika & Suastika, 2022). Actually, various countries in the world that embrace the concept and develop democracy have implemented democracy education (Santika, 2019). Although at the level of implementation, both in terms of material and methods, there are differences according to the locality of the style of each country (Santika et al., 2018).

It's fascinating to learn about democracy education in Indonesia. Given the lack of research demonstrating the government's efforts to form democratic citizens through democratic education. Communities can also comprehend the role of government in democratization. In this way, the research goal of a democratic citizen is met.

## RESEARCH METHODS

The type of research used in this article was qualitative research, which is research based on efforts to construct a view of the object of research in detail using words, a holistic and complex picture.

This research used an analytic descriptive approach, which is research intended to explore and find data that contains deep meaning, and examine existing problems. Using this analytic descriptive approach, this article explored comprehensively, objectively, and systematically the Government's efforts to form democratic citizens through democracy education.

This research used the literature study method, which is a method of collecting data by studying and interpreting various sources of literature in the form of books, journals, notes, or reports related to the research conducted. Data collection in this research used documentation and literature techniques. The data that has been collected was then studied and analyzed in depth and then presented in a systematic and holistic writing.

## DISCUSSION

### Democracy Education

Education and democracy (Amparo, 2008), (Yilmaz, 2009), Education and democracy, in fact, are related to each other and have a reciprocal relationship that cannot be separated. In the context of democracy, education serves to instill democratic values in students (democracy education or education about democracy) (Pusposari, 2017). Meanwhile, democracy means providing equal opportunities to every individual in the field of education without discriminating against religion, ethnicity, race, and also social status

so that individuals have the opportunity to express their views/opinions to develop their potential through education (Santika, 2021a). It is not wrong if some argue that democracy practiced in education (AG, 2022). Although in education, the concept of democracy is used in many and varied ways (Mårdh & Tryggvason, 2017).

But in the context of democracy education, it must be understood as a conscious effort to shape the ability of citizens to participate responsibly in the life of the nation and state (Sartini, 2014). This is in accordance with the purpose of democratic education itself, which is to form a democratic society. Substantively, to educate good citizens in order to realize a democratic society, democracy education is indispensable in the future (Sadiyo, 2003).

Democratic education is essentially the socialization of democratic values so that they can be accepted and implemented by citizens. The socialization of democratic values through democracy education is part of the political socialization of the state towards its citizens (Santika et al., 2019). In accordance with the meaning of education as a conscious and planned process, the socialization of democratic values is carried out in a planned, programmed, and well-organized manner, especially through formal education (Brent Edwards, 2010). Formal education, in this case schools, plays an important role in implementing democratic education to the

younger generation (Santika, 2020). The school system has an important role, especially for the continuity of a democratic political system through the cultivation of knowledge, awareness and democratic values (Sobri & Umar, 2022). The best way to educate people about democracy is to include democratic education (Alshurman, 2015). This is where the role of the state is to build democracy education.

So democracy education is a systematic effort made by the state and society to facilitate individual citizens to understand, live, practice, and develop the concepts, principles, and values of democracy based on their position and role in society (Nur & Sudarsono, 2019) (Khaerah et al., 2021).

In essence, democracy education helps the Government prepare citizens with critical thinking skills and democratic attitudes. (Santika et al., 2021), through the activity of instilling in new generations who are understand three things. First, democracy best guarantees the rights of citizens. Second, democracy is a learning process that is not easy to replicate. Third, the sustainability of democracy is largely determined by the success of passing on democratic values (justice, loyalty and freedom in a democratic political system) (Sihono, 2017). In other words, are citizens loyal enough to perform political tasks? (Straume, 2016)

Today, it shows that democracy is no longer defined as a political system and form

of government, but democracy has now become an attitude of life and a democratic belief. (Biesta, 2009), but often democracy is defined as a democratic outlook or attitude to life. Democracy requires real power and effort from all state administrators and citizens to behave in ways that support a democratic political system and government (Chayati et al., 2015).

The democratic education paradigm recommends a system of organizing education by involving social participation which includes educators, education personnel, government, and society together to improve the national education system (Rosyad & Indramayu, 2020). In the context of this research, it is the government that has the greatest role in efforts to form democratic citizens through democratic education.

### **Government Efforts in Forming Democratic Citizens.**

The government's efforts to form democratic citizens through democratic education can be seen in its various policies in the education field. Law No. 20/2003 which regulates the Indonesian National Education System in Article 3 states, "National education functions to develop abilities and shape the character and civilization of a dignified nation in order to educate the nation's life, aims to develop the potential of students to become human beings who are faithful and devoted to God Almighty, have noble character, are

healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, independent, and become democratic and responsible citizens".

To achieve the goals of national education, the Government seeks to establish and develop a national curriculum with reference to and oriented towards the National Education Standards (SNP). In this policy, it is determined that Civic Education is one of the mandatory contents of the curriculum at the primary and secondary education levels as well as in higher education. Here, it can be seen that the state is increasingly involved in shaping policies to design and direct the school curriculum to instill and internalize civic values in students' character (Morris et al., 2013). However, specifically in Indonesia, the Government's efforts to form democratic citizens through democracy education are implemented by integrating it into the subject or course of Citizenship Education.

So in accordance with Government policy, democracy education is an education that is integrated with the learning subject of Citizenship Education (Nurazizah & Dewi, 2021). This is in accordance with the task of Civic Education to prepare and shape students to become citizens with a responsible and democratic attitude (Hess & McAvoy, 2014). In other words, to be a good citizen (Dewey, 1923). So Civic Education has a fundamental task to teach democracy democratically through democratic education (Starkey & Osler, 2006).

In this case, it is Civic Education (PKn) that carries out the main task as a vehicle for democratic education in Indonesia (Batubara & Darmawan, 2017). Through civic education, there will be socialization and dissemination of democratic values in society. This is part of the ideals of democracy, one of which is to realize Civic Education as democratic education (Twiningsih, 2021).

In democracy education, Citizenship Education is a subject with a fundamental role. This is because Civic Education has a role to make and produce humans who have knowledge and understanding of the value of democracy. Through learning Citizenship Education, students are required to be able to develop and form a democratic attitude (Dianti et al., 2020).

Civic Education (Civics) is an urgent need for the Indonesian nation in building its democracy for the following reasons including: first, the increasing symptoms and trends of political illiteracy, Second, the emergence of political apathy, which can be seen from the lack of people's participation in a political process. If democracy is something that cannot be bargained for or set back (point of no return) for the Indonesian Nation, then Civic Education is one of the efforts to seed a culture of democracy (Nasution, 2016).

Then came a new policy from the Government, namely the Merdeka Curriculum. The entry into force of the independent curriculum, which was followed

by the issuance of the Decree of the Minister of Education, Culture, Research and Technology of the Republic of Indonesia Number 56 of 2022 which contains how to restore learning based on the curriculum, which has automatically changed the naming or nomenclature of Citizenship Education to Pancasila Education at the secondary and basic education levels. The implementation of the Merdeka Curriculum is implemented in stages. Of course, in the future democracy education will be integrated with Pancasila.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion above, it can be concluded that, the government's efforts to form democratic citizens through democracy education can be seen in its various policies in education. To achieve what is set as the goals in national education, the Government has developed a national curriculum that refers to the National Education Standards. Civic Education is one of the mandatory contents of the curriculum at all levels of education. Of course, the Government's efforts to form democratic citizens through democracy education are carried out by integrating Civics Education. The results of this research are expected to be used as input to the Government to further strengthen democracy education in Indonesia.

## REFERENCES

- [1] AG, T. (2022). Wawasan Al Qur'an Tentang Lembaga Pendidikan. *Jurnal Pendidikan Indonesia*, 2(9), 1639–1649.

- <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.36418/japendi.v2i9.657>
- [2] Alshurman, M. (2015). Democratic Education and Administration. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 176, 861–869. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.551>
- [3] Amparo, C.-C. (2008). On the distribution of education and democracy. *Journal of Development Economics*, 87(2), 179–190. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdeveco.2007.10.006>
- [4] Aspin, D. N. (2018). The Conception of Democracy: A Philosophy for Democratic Education 1. In *Creating and Managing the Democratic School* (pp. 30–59).
- [5] Batubara, A., & Darmawan, C. (2017). Demokrasi Pada Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Dengan Inovasi Media Pembelajaran. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Pancasila Dan Kewarganegaraan*, 2(2), 81–84. <http://journal2.um.ac.id/index.php/jppk>
- [6] Biesta, G. (2009). Sporadic Democracy: Education, Democracy and the Question of Inclusion Gert Biesta Institute of Education, University of Stirling Scotland, UK. In In: *Katz, M.S., Verducci, S., Biesta, G. (eds) Education, Democracy, and the Moral Life. Springer, Dordrecht* (pp. 1–11). [https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-8626-7\\_8](https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-8626-7_8)
- [7] Brent Edwards, D. (2010). Critical Pedagogy and Democratic Education: Possibilities for Cross-Pollination. *Urban Review*, 42(3), 221–242. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11256-009-0129-y>
- [8] Chayati, N., Supriyanto, Supriyanto, E., & Yahya, M. (2015). Pengelolaan Pembelajaran Sikap Demokratis di SMP Muhammadiyah 1 Kartasura. *Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmu Sosial*, 25(2), 20–33. <http://webcache.googleusercontent.com/search?q=cache:izezIz2zxsgJ:journals.ums.ac.id/index.php/jpis/article/download/1533/1075+&cd=3&hl=en&ct=clnk&gl=i>
- [9] Dewey, J. (1923). *Democracy and Education: An Introduction to the Philosophy of Education*. macmillan. <http://books.google.com/books?id=tfUvXujrJHEC&pgis=1>
- [10] Dianti, P., Waluyati, S. A., & Fatihah, H. (2020). Buku Ajar Pendidikan Demokrasi Berbasis Nilai. *Civic Hukum*, 5(1), 75–85. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22219/jch.v5i1.10493>
- [11] Duman, B. (2010). Correlation between the graduate-students' perception of educational philosophies and their democratic attitudes. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2(2), 5830–5834. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.03.951>
- [12] Hess, D. E., & McAvoy, P. (2014). The Political Classroom: Evidence and Ethics in Democratic Education. In *Supriyanto dan Rosad (2015)* (Vol. 5, Issue 3). <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315738871>
- [13] Khaerah, N., Prianto, A. L., & Harakan, A. (2021). Pendidikan Demokrasi Berbasis Sekolah. *Jurnal Pemberdayaan Nasyiatul Aisyiyah*, 1(1), 1–50.
- [14] Mårdh, A., & Tryggvason, Á. (2017). Democratic Education in the Mode of Populism. *Studies in Philosophy and Education*, 36(6), 601–613. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11217-017-9564-5>
- [15] Morris, P., Cogan, J. J., & Lid, M. (2013). A comparative overview: Civic education across the six societies. In *Civic Education in the Asia-Pacific Region* (Vol. 35, pp. 167–189). <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203951828-15>
- [16] Nasution, A. R. (2016). Urgensi Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan sebagai Pendidikan Karakter Bangsa Indonesia melalui Demokrasi, HAM dan Masyarakat Madani. *Jupiiis: Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 8(2), 201–212. <https://doi.org/10.24114/jupiiis.v8i2.5167>
- [17] Ngongo, K. P., & Gafur, A. (2017). Hubungan keterlibatan dalam organisasi badan (BEM) dengan keterampilan berpikir kritis dan sikap demokratis mahasiswa. *Harmoni Sosial: Jurnal Pendidikan IPS*, 4(1), 101–112. <https://doi.org/10.21831/hsjpi.v4i1.11282>
- [18] Nur, S., & Sudarsono, S. (2019). Implementasi Pendidikan Demokrasi Dalam Pembelajaran IPS Study Kasus Sma Negeri 6 Takalar. *Equilibrium: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 6(2), 95–103. <https://doi.org/10.26618/equilibrium.v6i2.25>

- [19] Nurazizah, T. S., & Dewi, D. A. (2021). Perjalanan Demokrasi di Indonesia serta Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan sebagai Pendidikan Demokrasi yang Berkarakter. *Journal of Education, Humaniora and Social Sciences (JEHSS)*, 4(1), 257–263. <https://doi.org/10.34007/jehss.v4i1.646>
- [20] Pusposari, D. (2017). Pendidikan yang Demokratis dalam Era Global. *Seminar Nasional: PS PBSI FKIP Universitas Jember*, 83–98. <https://jurnal.unej.ac.id>
- [21] Rini, N. D. A. (2017). Implementasi Nilai-Nilai Demokrasi Melalui Pembelajaran Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan. *Trihayu: Jurnal Pendidikan Ke-SD-An*, 3(3), 164.
- [22] Rosyad, A. M., & Indramayu, U. W. (2020). Islam Dalam Menghadapi Tantangan Globalisasi Di Indonesia. *Nazhruna*, 3(1), 75–99. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v3i1.491>
- [23] Sadiyo. (2003). Sumbangan Pendidikan dalam Pembangunan Demokrasi. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 10(1), 1–13.
- [24] Santika, I. G. N. (2019). Presidensialisme Dan Problematika Mekanisme Impeachment Presiden Dan / Atau Wakil Presiden Berdasarkan UUD 1945 Pasca Perubahan ( Perspektif Pergulatan Hukum Dan Politik ). *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Sosial*, 5(1), 23–34. <http://dx.doi.org/10.23887/jiis.v5i1.18777>
- [25] Santika, I. G. N. (2020). *Menggali dan Menemukan Roh Pancasila Secara Kontekstual*. Lakeisha.
- [26] Santika, I. G. N. (2021a). Grand Desain Kebijakan Strategis Pemerintah Dalam Bidang Pendidikan Untuk Menghadapi Revolusi Industri 4.0. *Jurnal Education and Development*, 9(2), 369–377.
- [27] Santika, I. G. N. (2021b). *Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan (Studi Komparatif Konstitusi Dengan UUD 1945)*. Lakeisha.
- [28] Santika, I. G. N. (2022). Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan: Problematika Hasil Perubahan UUD 1945 Secara Konseptual. In *CV. Global Aksara P ers* (Issue 1). Global Aksara Pers.
- [29] Santika, I. G. N., Rindawan, I. K., & Sujana, I. G. (2018). Memperkuat Pancasila Melalui Pergub No. 79 Tahun 2018 Dalam Menanggulangi Pengikisan Budaya Di Era Revolusi Industri 4.0. *Seminar Nasional Inovasi Dalam Penelitian Sains, Teknologi Dan Humaniora-InoBali*, 79, 981–990.
- [30] Santika, I. G. N., Sedana, G., Sila, M., Santika, I. W. E., Sujana, I. G., Yanti, A. A. I. E. K., Nugraha, D. M. D. P., Purandina, I. P. Y., Kontaniartha, I. W., Marsadi, D., Sudarmawan, I. P. Y., Swarniti, N. W., Wijaatmaja, A. B. M., & Sutrisna, G. (2021). *Aktualisasi Pancasila Dalam Berbagai Dimensi Kehidupan*. Lakeisha.
- [31] Santika, I. G. N., & Suastika, I. N. (2022). Efforts of State-Owned Enterprises (SOE) in Disseminating Pancasila by Actualizing Tri Hita Karana (THK). *Jurnal Etika Demokrasi (JED)*, 7(1), 14–27. <https://doi.org/10.26618/jed.v>
- [32] Santika, I. G. N., Sujana, G., & Winaya, M. A. (2019). Membangun Kesadaran Integratif Bangsa Indonesia Melalui Refleksi Perjalanan Historis Pancasila Dalam Perspektif Konflik Ideologis. *Journal of Etika Demokrasi (JED)*, 4(2), 89–98. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.26618/jed.v4i2.2391>
- [33] Sartini. (2014). Kebijakan Pendidikan dan Pendidikan Demokrasi: Perspektif Sejarah Otonomi Pendidikan di Indonesia. *Sosio E-Kons*, 6(1), 342. [http://journal.lppmunindra.ac.id/index.php/sosio\\_ekons/article/view/1717](http://journal.lppmunindra.ac.id/index.php/sosio_ekons/article/view/1717)
- [34] Sihono, T. (2017). Upaya Menuju Demokratisasi Pendidikan. *Jurnal Ekonomi & Pendidikan*, 8(20), 1–22.
- [35] Sobri, M., & Umar. (2022). Implementasi Pendidikan Demokrasi di Sekolah. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Konseling*, 105(2), 79. <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/322599509.pdf>
- [36] Starkey, H., & Osler, A. (2006). Education for Democratic Citizenship: a review of research, policy and practice 1995-2005. *Research Papers in Education*, 21(4), 433–466. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/02671520600942438>
- [37] Straume, I. S. (2016). Democracy, Education



and the Need for Politics. *Studies in Philosophy and Education*, 35(1), 29–45. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11217-015-9465-4>

- [38] Suryatni, L. U. H. (2014). Literasi Media dan Pendidikan Demokrasi Dalam Masyarakat Informasi. *Jurnal Sistem Informasi Universitas Suryadarma*, 6(1), 64–75. <https://doi.org/10.35968/jsi.v6i1.276>
- [39] Syahindra, O. M. D. (2019). Pengembangan Nilai-Nilai Demokrasi Di Sekolah. *Jurnal Hikmah*, 16(2), 67–75. [staisumatera-medan.ac.id/index.php/hikmah/article/view/4](https://staisumatera-medan.ac.id/index.php/hikmah/article/view/4)
- [40] Tican, C., & Taspinar, M. (2015). The effects of reflective thinking-based teaching activities on pre-service teachers' reflective thinking skills, critical thinking skills, democratic attitudes, and academic achievement. *Anthropologist*, 20(1–2), 111–120. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09720073.2015.11891730>
- [41] Twiningsih, A. (2021). Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan Sebagai Wahana Pendidikan Demokrasi Dalam Mewujudkan Smart and Good Citizen. *Edudikara : Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 6(2), 163–175.
- [42] Yilmaz, K. (2009). Democracy through learner-centered education: A Turkish perspective. *International Review of Education*, 55(1), 21–37. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-008-9112-1>
- [43] Yung, B. (2010). Can Confucianism add value to democracy education? *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2(2), 1919–1926. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.03.1010>
- [44] Zuiderwijk, A., & Janssen, M. (2014). Open data policies, their implementation and impact: A framework for comparison. *A Framework for Comparison. Government Information Quarterly*, 31(1), 17–29. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.giq.2013.04.003>
- [45] Zulfa, L. N., & Haryanto, H. (2021). Pengaruh Media Macromedia Flash Terhadap Literasi Sains dan Sikap Demokratis Mahasiswa. *Jurnal Pendidikan Sains Indonesia*, 9(1), 52–64. <https://doi.org/10.24815/jpsi.v9i1.18266>