Collaboration of Resources in Task Force for Prevention and Handling Victims of Human Trafficking in Indonesia

Rahmat Hidayat 1*), Syamsuddin2

1Department of Government Studies, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Singaperbangsa Karawang, Jl. HS.Ronggo Waluyo, Puseurjaya, Telukjambe Timur, Karawang, 41316, West Java, Indonesia.
2Department of Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Bosowa Makassar, Jl. Urip Sumoharjo No.4, Sinrijala, Panakkukang, Makassar, 90231, South Sulawesi, Indonesia.

Received: 4 December 2019; Revised: 4 July 2020; Accepted: 12 October 2020

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to examine the cause of the ineffectiveness of resource collaboration in preventing and handling trafficking victims in West Java Province. This research method is a qualitative study that focuses on human and social problems through primary and secondary data collection. The results of this study indicate that the collaboration of resources in the prevention and handling of victims of trafficking in persons in West Java Province has not been effective. It triggered by the leading sector, problems of coordination of sharing resources, overlapping problems, roles, and resources, political factors, constraints of responsiveness of policymakers, and administrative issues.

Keywords: Collaboration; Taskforce; Prevention; Victim; Human Trafficking


Permalink/DOI: https://doi.org/10.26618/ojip.v10i2.2824

*) Corresponding Author.
E-Mail: rahmat.hidayat@unsika.ac.id
INTRODUCTION

In Indonesia, some regions that have victims of trafficking and violence against women and children who are quite concerned (Evingrum & Jamin, 2019). Data from the West Java BP3AKB office on trafficking cases shows that five provinces in Indonesia are quite high, including DKI Jakarta with 480, West Java with 738, East Java with 430, Gorontalo 160, and North Sumatra 170 cases. West Java became the province with the most cases (Borualogo, 2018). This issue has become one of the associations of human rights activists; moreover, Indonesia is considered a country that is not serious in handling the problem of trafficking in persons (Sapardjaja, 2003). It is necessary to coordinate and collaborate intensively between the membership of the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons in West Java Province to deal with cases victims of trafficking in persons in West Java (Sarihati, Mukhlisiana, & Krisnayana, 2020).

Basically, the policy on prevention and handling of victims of trafficking in persons in West Java Province has been included in the West Java Governor's decision regarding task force Number 467.2/Kep.287-BP3AKB/2015, then revised to West Java Governor Decree Number 467/Kep.763-BP3AKB/2017, and the last revision of the Decree of the Governor Number 467/Kep.402_Yanbangsos/2019. But the Task Force has not collaborated well. Hidayat (2019) suggested that the implementers of the Task Force for the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons in the Province of West Java have not established intensive coordination including sharing roles and resources.

The efforts to prevent and handle trafficking victims in West Java Province require coordination and collaboration between institutions because this problem is very complicated when examined from the causes. Factors causing human trafficking problems are social issues, religious understanding, economic issues, legislation, policies, and education (Bintari & Djustiana, 2015). Thus the membership of the Prevention Task Force and in Java Barat should work together on this issue. The research focuses on the coordination and collaboration between State civil apparatuses for the handling of victims of trafficking in persons and violence against women and children in West Java. The main objective of this research is to analyse and evaluate the reasons for the ineffective cooperation of merging and sharing resources for preventing and handling trafficking victims in West Java Province.

RESEARCH METHODS

The study was qualitative with descriptive data analysis. Qualitative studies are based on the investigation process, which focuses on human and social problems. The research data collected consisted of two types, namely primary data and secondary data. Primary data is collected through participant observation and in-depth interviews with research informants, while secondary information is obtained through literature studies such as written documents, literature studies, and related research results, then the data are analyzed using qualitative analysis developed from the model qualitative research from Miles and Hagerman consisting of data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions/verification.

From the model, it was explained that the qualitative data analysis in this study consisted of three steps, namely:

1. Data Reduction; The reduction technique can be done by summarising the informants' answers and then reducing them using the language of the researcher, sorting and selecting data according to the substance of the re-
search/irrelevant data, eliminating the categorisation/code of the research informant.

2. Data Presentation; Presentation of data is structuring the data in such a way that it is possible to conclude. Presentation of data can be done in the form of charts/matrices, narratives, relations of two or more categories.

3. Conclusion; The research was carried out in West Java Province with the consideration that the West Java Province was declared as a vulnerable area to cases of victims of trafficking in persons and became one of the regions of origin and the largest sender of victims of trafficking in persons in Indonesia.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

One of the causes of collaborative collaboration between the government and non-government in realising governance is cooperation that was initiated on the limited capacity of resources and networks owned by each party. The partnership can unite and complement the various components that drive the success of achieving common goals (Subarsono, 2002). The results of the study based on observations, in-depth interviews and literature studies show that various limitations of resources among the membership of the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence Against Women and Children in West Java Province are as follows, leading sector problems, resource sharing coordination, overlapping roles and responsibilities, political factors, Policymakers response, and administrative problems.

Leading Sector Problems

Dwiyanto (2015) emphasised that collaborative cooperation requires a process whereby organisations that have an interest in a problem seek to find a solution according to a mutual agreement in achieving its goals. One of the indications is that each party has the autonomy and power to make decisions independently. Although previously they had agreed to submit to a mutual agreement, what is also worth noting is that essential that the dominance of the autonomy is obscuring the commitment of the primary goal of transformational collaborative cooperation or systemic capacity building. The parties have erred and forgotten that the fundamental prerequisite of cooperative collaboration is that each party must strive to realise the goals and values that exceed it (Powell, Christ, & Birkhead, 2008).

The phenomenon is a condition with the results of a research study based on observations and research interviews with resource persons which among others emphasize that the authority to share roles is basically the coordinative authority of the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence Against Women and Children in West Java Province. The police constrained by the Task Force implementor is still struggling with Leading Sector, for example, the implementor is busy with his task, even though there are responsibilities outside the job as the translation of the task in the account and the impact of work outside the agency or institution. For example, the Functional Literacy program at the West Java Provincial Education Office, which means that people who are entitled to Education are not only formal but non-formal. It was further explained that if the trafficking victims were children who were fourteen years old, the repatriation program, one of which was to foster interest in schools. If the West Java Provincial Education Office does not carry out a plan of activities related to trafficking, the process of sharing roles does not materialise. Basically the West Java Provincial Education Office makes the program pertaining to trafficking only the problem is the Leading Sector
feels that function is more important then it is done alone so that it is chaotic and not in accordance with previous commitments even though the West Java Provincial Education Office should continue to involve the Prevention and Management Task Force Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence Against Women and Children in West Java Province, although the budget continues to come from the West Java Provincial Education Office, the role of the Task Force continues.

Resource Sharing Coordination

Prevention and Management of Victims of Trafficking in Persons in West Java Province involve the Regional Police of West Java. It is indicated by the collaboration of the Regional Police with the Women’s Protection Office of the Women’s Empowerment Office for Protection of Children and Family Planning in Indonesia called Dinas Perlindungan Perempuan dari Dinas Pemberdayaan Perempuan Perlindungan Anak Dan Keluarga Berencana (DP3AKB) as the Chair of the Task Force Daily to carry out preventive actions in the form of:

1. Socialisation and understanding of trafficking to all village officials or village heads in the regencies/cities of West Java Province in waves/phases.
2. Socialisation and seminar titled trafficking, which was attended by the Office of the Protection of Women and Children, District Police and City Police in West Java Province.
3. Socialisation titled trafficking to the army of village builder called BABINSA, and the military fosters security and order called BABINKAMTIBMAS as officials who often mingle with the community.
4. The Regional Police of West Java Province is regularly invited as a guest speaker to provide training on the theme of trafficking.

Observation results indicate that the involvement of the West Java Provincial Education Office in its capacity as an implementer of the West Java Province Child Prevention and Participation Sub-Task Force appears to have not been active. One indication of the impact of the problem is the controlled BABINSA and BABINKAMTIBMAS to provide socialisation in schools.

To anticipate these problems, the Police have been expected by suggesting the BABINSA and BABINKAMTIBMAS coordinate with the students in each school. Through this socialisation, students can be equipped with knowledge about trafficking so that they are not easily tempted by offers of work abroad with only a conditional document of Identity Card (KTP) and a diploma. Reflecting on this condition, it concluded that the Education Office of West Java Province and Regency / City had not prepared the time to handle the problem.

Cooperation in terms of handling victims, the West Java Provincial Police rate is quite good. They were involved in the victim pick-up activity in collaboration between the West Java Provincial Police and the Women’s Protection Office of Women’s Empowerment and Child Planning Family Empowerment Office. This program is especially for victims who are exploited throughout Indonesia. Except for victims who are used abroad, the Regional Police cannot hold a Task Force because the Task Force’s budget is not allocated for picking up victims who are exploited elsewhere.

The informant hopes that this can be a recommendation for further study considering that trafficking cases do not only occur on a national scale but are organised crime whose networks involve relations between countries. For matters such as international, the West Java Provincial Police did not collaborate with the Task Force on the Prevention and Management of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children involv-
ing the Regional Police of West Java Province. Task Force has a limited budget. However, the West Java Provincial Police coordinated with the National Police Headquarters of the Republic of Indonesia (POLRI) and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. The conclusion is still using the POLRI budget. Likewise, the possibility of other department using the central budget such as the Office for the Protection of Women from the Office for Empowering Women for Child Protection and Family Planning (DP3AKB) of West Java Province uses the Ministry of Women's Protection budget. West Java Province Social Service uses Ministry of Social budget.

It was further explained that sometimes the National Police felt it was limited to "Vehicle Rental" which was intended only to pick up victims. Although it is realised that the Indonesian National Police has an internal budget related to the handling of victims, it needs to be a common concern that the investigation of cases of trafficking and processing of victims may continue and develop the situation. In the aftermath of the handling, the Indonesian National Police must be involved, such as the victim has been returned to the area of origin, the Indonesian National Police still has an obligation to monitor and monitor the condition of the victim so that they are not entangled again as victims for the umpteenth time, considering that trafficking victims are generally uneducated and weak and the economy is weak.

Fully realised that the Department of Health as a function of rehabilitation of victims was involved but not yet optimal. The indications are that when examinations are required, and a visum is taken for victims from the Port of Sukabumi Regency who is exploited as commercial sex workers by the West Java Provincial Police, victims often experience various obstacles and complaints such as having to queue, victims are subject to examination and treatment costs, or even victims have BPJS cards but are required to complete administrative requirements and various other problems. The hope of the Provincial Police to the Provincial Health Office as fellow implementer of the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province is a collaborative collaboration in handling victims because the process of examining victims must be carried out in stages, a long time, and prolonged especially if the victim must be considered reproductive equipment that is not just once or twice handling. Further explained that in cases like this, the Regional Police of West Java Province has not felt synergy in their capacity as the implementer of the Task Force for Law Enforcement Sub-Task Force Prevention and Handling Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province.

It emphasised that in addition to the Health Office, it appeared that the West Java Provincial Police had experienced collaborative obstacles with the Social Service. It explained that not all Social Services or P2TP2A in West Java Province or City had a Shelter or Home Visit for the handling of victims so that the Indonesian National Police felt confused and in the end, the victims were referred to institutions that had a shelter. It is unfortunate that some P2TP2A in the Regency or City of West Java Province are limited to names but do not have shelter, sometimes it is also found that there are office facilities but none that handle them. P2TP2A conditions that are quite good from the perspective of the Regional Police of West Java Province are P2TP2A Garut Regency, Indramayu Regency, Bogor, and the City of Bandung.

With these various polemics, the hope of the Indonesian National Police is the collaboration in the Task Force on Prevention and Management of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against
Women and Children. Always prioritise the sharing of resources and information. A coordination meeting of the Task Force on the Prevention and Management of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children of West Java Province should be held at least three or four meetings. Special attention is needed from the Director of Criminal Investigation POLRI and the top leadership of the Indonesian National Police, agencies, and related institutions, and the need to advocate investigators at the provincial and district city levels not to stigmatise victims repeatedly.

Furthermore, reaping a response from the West Java Provincial Police based on interviews that confirmed that in terms of Regional Police, the need for handling victims is not only completed in the pick-up process, but the perpetrators must also be addressed on one side of the budget allotment from the Task Force only for picking up victims. Under these conditions negotiations and debates occur so that in the end a scenario is made that before working as a trafficker, the previous perpetrators were trafficking victims as well so for this reason the perpetrators were finally picked up and detained in the West Java Provincial Police.

Basically the explanation put forward by the Daily Chair of the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province has justified the theory of Kun corro (2014) which confirms that the affairs that are entirely the affairs of the central government include foreign policy, defence, security, national monetary and fiscal, judicial authority, and religion. The Regional Police of West Java Province which has the power of jurisdiction in terms of cracking down on every actor who violates state law means including a vertical institution and is an authority or central function that is not autonomous, meaning that the principle of money follows function and structures supports services becomes the affairs of the central government and not the authority of the regional government.

Overlapping Roles and Responsibilities

The results of the research study show that basically before the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia was formed, the authority in preventing and handling victims of trafficking in persons, violence against women and children became the authority of the Ministry of Social Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia and its ranks. However, when the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia has been formed, it has become the authority of this institution to take care of it, but unfortunately the remaining budget in the Ministry of Social Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia has not been delegated to the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia.

In connection with this it turns out the existence of the Office of the Empowerment of Women Protection of Children and Family Planning (DP3AKB) of West Java Province as an extension of the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection of the Republic of Indonesia in the region, reaping various things, primarily related to Overlapping or the similarity of roles and resources with the West Java Provincial Social Service as an extension of the Ministry of Social Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia.

Some indication of the findings obtained through the results of a research interview showed that the Social Service of West Java Province with the Office of Empowerment of Women Protection of Children and Family Planning (DP3AKB) of the Province of Java has many main tasks and functions. For example, the Office of Women’s Empowerment for Protection of Children and Family Planning (DP3AKB)
of the Province of Java has the purpose of the Protection of Women and Children, while in the Social Service Office of West Java the Province also has the Field of Protection and Social Security. Sometimes the problem is when handling victims who are rehabilitated in shelters.

An equally important indication is information from research sources, it is very personal that there is a great deal of overlap between the main tasks and functions as well as the budget in the List of Budget Implementing Entries called DIPA between DP3AKB of West Java Province and West Java Provincial Social Service. One indication shows that in the process of handling victims, in this case, the pickup of exploited victims outside the territory of West Java Province always involves DP3AKB and the West Java Provincial Social Service simultaneously. This condition greatly influences the ineffectiveness of the West Java Province Regional Budget. It further explained that the Task Force for the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence Against Women and Children in West Java Province requires repositioning of the duties and responsibilities of the implementer with a clear Job Description because it is seen not as a problem, but the impact is actually higher than that it requires a clarity of the scheme budget for budget preparation and proposals in the Budget Implementation Entry List (DIPA) from the office to the budget planning team through the Development Planning Conference.

Political Factors

Discussing about the penetration of the political context in relation of collaboration between the Regional Government of West Java Province with cross-sectoral and private sectors in the Task Force on Prevention and Handling Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province, the author is reminded of the theory of policy implementation initiated by Grindle (1980) asserted that the characteristic of public policy implementation in developing countries is the dominance of political and administrative elements in the process of policy implementation. Penetration of legislative and bureaucratic aspects in the implementation of policies has an impact on the ineffectiveness of the government in collaboration with various parties in achieving the goals agreed upon in advance. The statement received theoretical support as stated by Joshi, Wibawa, & Sinclair (2001), and Santoso (2012) that the policy portrait in developing countries such as Indonesia is a requirement as a political and administrative process. It is explained as a political process because there are voting and choosing activities involving many actors along with political interests that have the potential to trigger conflicts of interest by requiring the use of authority and power.

The policy portrait is mainly explained in Indonesia on an administrative basis because to realise these political decisions using a series of policy instruments to produce the expected changes such as coloured by the negotiations of the implementers and in the process of implementing decisions the role of the government apparatus dominates the public policy process. The thought that has been raised by (Grindle, 1980; Joshi, Wibawa, & Sinclair 2001; Santoso, 2012) in reality also colours the situation and condition of the activities of policy implementers in the Task Force on Prevention and Handling Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province. It indicated based on the results of the study through observation, in-depth interviews with research sources and related literature studies.

The results of the study show that one of the weaknesses in sharing roles and resources in the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of
Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province is politically dominated by individual institutions although it cannot be denied that the amount of the budget allocation for prevention and handling victims of trafficking because of the political elite’s partiality towards the problem. However, it also hurt synergy and collaborative cooperation in the Task Force on the Prevention and Management of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province. The indications are that one of the forerunners would be ineffective cooperation and coordination in the Task Force at that time because it was politically dominated by political elites who had an emotional closeness relationship with the authorities in West Java Province at that time.

Another indication of political penetration in the Task Force is the alleged shift in values in which the regional leader is more Aware or attention to his victorious team. The results of research interviews show that the fortune of the Office of the Empowerment of Women Protection of Children and Family Planning (DP3AKB) of West Java Province in the previous leadership of policymakers was due to the closeness and alignments emotionally, physically and psychologically of the political elite of the politicians on the problem of victims of trafficking and violence against women and children in the province of West Java so that it impacts on a sizable budget allocation allocated to the P2TP2A institutional project of West Java Province. However, some parties considered that the dominance of the political elite’s interference in the policy implementation process was considered a Value of Less Ethical according to the ethical and political theory of government.

Policymakers Response

Referring to the argument put forward by Priansa (2017) asserting that leadership in public organisations should ideally not only lie with the authorities but must be able to become the spirit for all apparatus following their duties and functions so that joint responsibilities emerge that can support the best achievement of organisational performance public.

To support this direction, thinking about leadership matters, namely thinking about responsiveness, roles, and leadership capabilities, is very important. It intended that each component in a public organisation has an understanding of nature and actual conditions of the role and ability of leaders to solve problems and bring about change and be able to bring the aspirations of the apparatus working as their teams.

Referring to these thoughts and when related to the condition of the responsiveness of policymakers in the Province of West Java to the problem of the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in the Province of West Java, has a powerful role.

It indicated by the results of the study based on explanations from several research sources who stated that the responsiveness of policymakers (Policy Makers) through the review of activity reports played a significant role in increasing or reducing budget allocations in conducting prevention and handling programs for trafficking victims in West Java Province. The problem is that expertise is needed from implementers to convince policymakers (Policy Makers). Another indication is that sometimes Sector Leading, in this case, Head of Offices and leaders of institutions are reluctant to allocate the Task Force budget which is thematically in their offices or institutions because they feel that this is not their duty and responsibility.
Administrative Problems

The existence of a regulatory context that is basically intended for the realization of the effectiveness and efficiency of public services, but at the implementation level sometimes produces a dilemma, especially related to the political context of the actions of administrators and administrative procedures in relation to the role of public policy implementation (Grindle, 1980). The idea of regulatory context issues according to the theory of public policy implementation (Grindle, 1980) has a close relationship if it is associated with one indication of research findings based on interviews with research sources who confirm that one of the administrative obstacles in collaborative collaboration is the Task Force on Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province is weak coordination both internally in the Task Force in the provinces and cities of West Java and between the Task Force of West Java Province and other Provinces where the victims from West Java are exploited. One example of a case such as the pickup of victims from West Java Province who were exploited in the Batam Islands constrained due to the lack of chronological data as victims. At the same time, the implementor is required to leave for the victim suddenly. Other indications based on the results of the research study through observation and research interviews obtained an explanation that up to now in the Budget Implementation Entry List called DIPA as a budget implementation document made by the Sector Leading and the heads of institutions incorporated in the Task Force, there has not been found any Gender Identity Stage especially trafficking budget specifications. One indication is that the Regional Apparatus Organizations and implementors in the institution do not yet understand the preparation and submission of a Gender Responsive Budget even though they have often been given various training.

The study was supported by interviews with research sources who confirmed that the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province is only rated as a "Value Pack" but the institutional responsibility. To date, the West Java Provincial Social Service has never received a budget allocation from the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province and in handling victims, never on behalf of the Task Force. I do not know according to the source if DP3AKB of West Java Province on service and other institutions in the name of the Task Force on Prevention and Handling Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province.

In handling trafficking victims, the West Java Provincial Social Service uses the agency’s internal budget, as well as when there is a financial audit from the Government Finance Audit Agency, it has never been questioned in relation to the West Java Provincial Social Service with the Task Force on Prevention and Handling Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence Against Women and Children in West Java Province. In addition to this, according to the interviewees, the Task Force’s budgetary issues were never questioned and were questioned in the budget by the results of the examination of the Government Financial Examination Board.

Some of the solutions offered by the resource persons through interviews that the Task Force for the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province, if they want to improve their functions and roles, should be facilitated by institutional
strengthening, a more operational legal umbrella, budget support along with facilities and infrastructure, regulatory support. According to him, data and information regarding the prevention and handling of victims of trafficking in persons, violence against women and children in West Java Province will be optimal if a Task Force secretariat is formed, operational officers are created, there is a transparent Operational Procedure System (SOP) and a Secretariat for the Task Force for Prevention and Handling Victims Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province must play a role as a coordinating institution. The crucial issue is due to budget constraints and budget efficiency issues so that the budget of the Task Force on the Prevention and Handling of Victims of Trafficking in Persons, Violence against Women and Children in West Java Province is not allocated. This condition is one of the reasons why the Task Force's function is only attached to the main tasks and duties of the department and related institutions.

Other indications show that disorientation is still found among law enforcers in handling trafficking cases. The primary function of the National Police is the executor and investigative purposes of the case, the Prosecutor as the public prosecutor, and the Judge as the adjudicator of the case. The results of interviews with research sources obtained an explanation that there are still law enforcers who do not understand the handling of victims of trafficking which results in delays in P21.

It confirmed through interviews with other informants who confirmed that among law enforcers, there were still conflicts and different perceptions. On the one hand, the POLRI wants the case to be finished quickly and on the one hand such as the Public Prosecutor who hears the case needing more material from the POLRI because it is difficult later if it is not met when the victim’s trial is being conducted. The expectation from the Indonesian National Police is that the Attorney General as the Prosecutor and Judge as the Terminator of the Trafficking Case have a common perception, meaning that there are findings of Prosecutors who do not have an understanding of trafficking whereas in training on handling trafficking conducted by the Indonesian Police often involve Prosecutors and Judges.

CONCLUSION

The handling of victims of trafficking in persons, violence against women and children in the province of West Java has not been effective in the cooperation of sharing of resources in the prevention and handling of victims of trafficking in persons in the region of West Java. It triggered by several dimensions including leading sector issues, problems of coordination of sharing resources, overlapping issues, roles, and resources, political factors, constraints of responsiveness of policymakers, administrative matters.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We would like to thank our colleagues at Universitas Singaperbangsa Karawang and Universitas Bosowa Makassar for the support and discussions that took place during the research and writing process of this article.

REFERENCES


